```
1
            IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
                                                             1
                                                                                      Wednesday Afternoon Session
             FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO
                                                             2
                                                                                       May 14, 2008, 1:50 p.m.
                     EASTERN DIVISION
                                                             3
                                                             4
                                                                               STIPULATIONS
     Raymond Gibson,
                                                             5
             Plaintiff,
                                                             6
                                                                      It is stipulated by counsel in attendance that
                                                             7
                                                                 the deposition of Melody Conrad, a witness herein,
                               : Case No. 07-377
                                Judge Marbley
                                                             8
                                                                 called by the Plaintiff for cross-examination, may
     The Shelly Company,
                               : Magistrate Judge Abel
                                                             9
                                                                 be taken at this time by the notary by notice and
             Defendant.
                                                            10
                                                                 agreement that said deposition may be reduced to
                                                            11
                                                                 writing in stenotypy by the notary, whose notes
                                                                 may thereafter be transcribed out of the presence
                                                            12
                                                            13
                                                                 of the witness; that proof of the official
                DEPOSITION OF MELODY CONRAD
                                                            14
                                                                 character and qualification of the notary is
                                                            15
                                                                 waived; that the signature of the witness to the
                                                                 transcript of said deposition is expressly waived
             Taken at Spectrum Reporting LLC
                                                            17
                                                                 by counsel and the witness; said deposition to
                 333 East Stewart Avenue
                                                            18
                                                                 have the same force and effect as though signed by
                    Columbus, OH 43206
                  May 14, 2008, 1:50 p.m.
                                                            19
                                                                 the said Melody Conrad.
                                                            20
                  Spectrum Reporting LLC
                                                            21
         333 Stewart Avenue, Columbus, Ohio 43206
                                                            22
               614-444-1000 or 800-635-9071
                 www.spectrumreporting.com
                                                            23
                                                            2.4
                      APPEARANCES
                                                             1
                                                                                     I N D E X
 2
                                                                 Examination By
                                                                                                               Page
     ON BEHALF OF PLAINTIFF:
                                                             3
                                                                 Ms. Cunningham - Cross
                                                                                                                  5
 3
                                                                 Mr. Kelly - Cross
                                                                                                                 38
           Teresa Cunningham, Esq.
                                                                 Ms. Cunningham - Further Cross
                                                             4
                                                                                                                 41
 4
           71 Cavalier Boulevard, Suite 100
                                                             5
           Florence, KY 41042
                                                                 Plaintiff's Exhibits
                                                                                                               Page
 5
                                                             6
     ON BEHALF OF DEFENDANT:
 6
                                                                  20 - Letter to Montgomery from Yoakum,
                                                                                                                 27
 7
          Frantz Ward
                                                             7
                                                                       3-27-07
           127 Public Square
          Cleveland, OH 44114
8
                                                             8
          By Brian J. Kelly, Esq.
                                                             9
9
                                                            10
10
     ON BEHALF OF WITNESS:
                                                            11
11
           State of Ohio Assistant Attorney General
                                                            12
           Employment Law Section
                                                            13
           150 E. Gay Street, 22nd Floor
12
                                                            14
           Columbus, OH 43215
                                                            15
13
           By Pooja Alag Bird, Esq.
                                                            16
14
15
     ALSO PRESENT:
                                                            17
16
          Raymond Gibson
                                                            18
17
                                                            19
18
                                                            20
19
                                                            21
20
                                                            2.2
21
                                                                 (Exhibits attached to the original transcript.)
22
                                                            23
23
                                                            2.4
24
```

1	5		7
1	Melody Conrad	1	A. A transportation tech 1.
2	being first duly sworn, testifies and says as	2	Q. And were you eventually moved out of
3	follows:	3	that position?
4	CROSS-EXAMINATION	4	A. No.
5	BY MS. CUNNINGHAM:	5	Q. Okay. There was some point when you
6	Q. Could you state your name for the	6	were doing EEO contract compliance reviews?
7	record and spell your last name, please.	7	A. Uh-huh.
8	A. Melody Conrad, C-O-N-R-A-D.	8	Q. What year was that?
9	Q. My name is Teresa Cunningham, I	9	A. I started doing contract compliance
10	represent Ray Gibson in the case captioned Gibson	10	reviews 15 years ago.
11	vs. Shelly Company.	11	Q. Okay. Maybe I'm misunderstanding.
12	We're here today for your deposition.	12	That's the construction project specialist
13	Have you been deposed before?	13	position?
14	A. No.	14	A. No. The construction project
15	Q. Okay. I'll be asking you a series of	15	specialist is where I oversaw projects.
16	questions. If you can't hear the question or you	16	Q. Okay.
17	don't understand me, please ask me to repeat it;	17	A. And then they promoted me over to a
18	otherwise, I'll assume that you understand the	18	transportation tech 1.
19	question.	19	Q. Oh, I see.
20	Where are you currently employed?	20	A. And gave me the EEO job duties.
21	A. ODOT.	21	Q. Okay. I see.
22	Q. And what's your position at ODOT?	22	And during what years were you doing
23	A. I'm a transportation tech 1.	23	that?
24	Q. And when were you first hired by ODOT?	24	A. I've been doing it for the last 15
	6		8
1	A. 1988.	1	years.
2	A. 1988. Q. What was your position?	1 2	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it?
2	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1.	1 2 3	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes.
2	A. 1988. Q. What was your position?	1 2	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs
2 3 4 5	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1.	1 2 3	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes.
2 3 4 5	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or	1 2 3 4 5	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs
2 3 4 5	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position?	1 2 3 4 5	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district.
2 3 4 5 6 7	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry?	1 2 3 4 5 6 7	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry?	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties?	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties? A. I oversaw projects, inspectors. It was	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those? A. 15 years.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties? A. I oversaw projects, inspectors. It was inspection.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those? A. 15 years. Q. Okay. You've been the only person
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties? A. I oversaw projects, inspectors. It was inspection. Q. What do you mean by you oversaw	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those? A. 15 years. Q. Okay. You've been the only person going out there for 15 years?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties? A. I oversaw projects, inspectors. It was inspection. Q. What do you mean by you oversaw projects?	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those? A. 15 years. Q. Okay. You've been the only person going out there for 15 years? A. No. I've been the only one the last
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties? A. I oversaw projects, inspectors. It was inspection. Q. What do you mean by you oversaw projects? A. I was the inspector on the project. We	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those? A. 15 years. Q. Okay. You've been the only person going out there for 15 years? A. No. I've been the only one the last five years that's been out there doing reviews for
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties? A. I oversaw projects, inspectors. It was inspection. Q. What do you mean by you oversaw projects? A. I was the inspector on the project. We made sure that the work got done.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those? A. 15 years. Q. Okay. You've been the only person going out there for 15 years? A. No. I've been the only one the last five years that's been out there doing reviews for them.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties? A. I oversaw projects, inspectors. It was inspection. Q. What do you mean by you oversaw projects? A. I was the inspector on the project. We made sure that the work got done. Q. Okay. And were you moved out of that	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those? A. 15 years. Q. Okay. You've been the only person going out there for 15 years? A. No. I've been the only one the last five years that's been out there doing reviews for them. Q. I'm sorry. Who went out there before
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties? A. I oversaw projects, inspectors. It was inspection. Q. What do you mean by you oversaw projects? A. I was the inspector on the project. We made sure that the work got done. Q. Okay. And were you moved out of that position?	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those? A. 15 years. Q. Okay. You've been the only person going out there for 15 years? A. No. I've been the only one the last five years that's been out there doing reviews for them. Q. I'm sorry. Who went out there before you?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties? A. I oversaw projects, inspectors. It was inspection. Q. What do you mean by you oversaw projects? A. I was the inspector on the project. We made sure that the work got done. Q. Okay. And were you moved out of that position? A. Yes.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	years. Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those? A. 15 years. Q. Okay. You've been the only person going out there for 15 years? A. No. I've been the only one the last five years that's been out there doing reviews for them. Q. I'm sorry. Who went out there before you? A. Before it was it was whoever
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties? A. I oversaw projects, inspectors. It was inspection. Q. What do you mean by you oversaw projects? A. I was the inspector on the project. We made sure that the work got done. Q. Okay. And were you moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And when was that?	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those? A. 15 years. Q. Okay. You've been the only person going out there for 15 years? A. No. I've been the only one the last five years that's been out there doing reviews for them. Q. I'm sorry. Who went out there before you? A. Before it was it was whoever whatever district you worked in, the contractor
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. 1988. Q. What was your position? A. Project inspector 1. Q. And were you eventually promoted or moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And what position were you moved into? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. I'm sorry? A. A construction project specialist 1. Q. What were your job duties? A. I oversaw projects, inspectors. It was inspection. Q. What do you mean by you oversaw projects? A. I was the inspector on the project. We made sure that the work got done. Q. Okay. And were you moved out of that position? A. Yes. Q. And when was that? A. It's been 15 years ago.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. Okay. And you're still doing it? A. Yes. Q. Does ODOT assign transportation techs to certain companies to do the compliance reviews? A. No. You're assigned by your district. Q. Okay. You're assigned by district. And you do the compliance reviews on The Shelly Company? A. Yes. Q. And how long have you been doing those? A. 15 years. Q. Okay. You've been the only person going out there for 15 years? A. No. I've been the only one the last five years that's been out there doing reviews for them. Q. I'm sorry. Who went out there before you? A. Before it was it was whoever whatever district you worked in, the contractor worked in, that that district could do the review

```
9
                                                                                                                      11
     only so that there's no traveling.
                                                              1
                                                                  promote to a management position.
2
                Where you live?
                                                              2
                                                                              Okay. So do you just report what they
                Where the contractor resides.
                                                              3
                                                                  tell you?
 3
                Okay. Okay. I -- I guess I'm still
                                                              4
                                                                  Α.
 4
                                                                              IIh-huh.
 5
     not understanding. Why were you assigned to
                                                              5
                                                                  Ο.
                                                                              Do you review documentation?
     Shelly?
 6
                                                              6
                                                                              Okay. Do you know Candace Gales?
 7
                Because they're within my -- they're
                                                              7
 8
     within my district. I have seven counties.
9
                Okay.
                                                              9
                                                                              Okay. When did you first meet
10
                And if the contractor's main office is
                                                             10
                                                                  Ms. Gales?
     within my seven counties, I do the reviews now.
11
                                                             11
                                                                  Α.
                                                                              About 20 years ago.
12
     Ο.
                Okav.
                                                             12
                                                                  Ο.
                                                                              Okay. How did you meet her?
13
                Before, it's where they -- even though
                                                             13
                                                                  Α.
                                                                              Through ODOT.
14
     they might have been in my district but they
                                                             14
                                                                              Okay. That was before you were doing
15
     worked in another district with a dollar amount,
                                                             15
                                                                  these compliance reviews?
     then that district would do the review.
16
                                                             16
17
                                                             17
                                                                              Do you recall the circumstances when
18
                But there was a lot of traveling
                                                             18
                                                                  you met her?
19
     involved, overnight stays and that, so ODOT had
                                                             19
                                                                              She was in central office in the EEO
     stopped that. And now we just do our reviews
                                                                  office when I met her.
20
                                                             20
21
     within our districts.
                                                             21
                                                                  Ο.
                                                                              With The Shelly Company?
22
                Okay. Tell me, when you do a contract
                                                             22
                                                                              No, with ODOT.
23
     compliance review, what do you do?
                                                             23
                                                                              Oh, with ODOT. Oh, she was with ODOT
2.4
                I just go in there to make sure that
                                                                  and then went over to The Shelly Company?
                                                         10
                                                                                                                      12
     they are showing good faith efforts in meeting
                                                              1
                                                                  Α.
                                                                             Uh-huh.
1
     their minority and female goals.
 2
                                                                             Are you friends?
                                                                             Just talk -- not -- no. Not -- we're
 3
                What do you mean by they're meeting
     their good faith efforts to meet goals?
                                                                  business friends but not outside of business, no.
 5
                Good faith efforts. Goals is a goal;
                                                              5
                                                                             Okay. Do you ever talk to her outside
     it's not a requirement. And we look at it to see
                                                                  of these compliance reviews?
 6
                                                              6
     good faith efforts. Are they -- if you're a union
                                                              7
                                                                             Only if I have a problem with a --
     contractor, are you sending letters out to the
                                                                  getting reports from her that I need.
8
                                                              8
     union requesting minorities and female for that
9
                                                              9
                                                                             Okay. How often do you do the reviews?
10
     classification, and any replies back from the
                                                             10
                                                                             Once a year.
11
     unions.
                                                             11
                                                                             Are you on a schedule, like every --
                                                                  whatever time every year annually you go in and do
12
                Do your reviews only cover union
                                                             12
13
     employees?
                                                             13
                                                                  the reviews?
                If the contractor is a union. Shelly
                                                                             Not necessarily. I might do them in
14
                                                             14
15
     Company is a union contractor.
                                                             15
                                                                  September, any time between September and
16
                Okay. Let's just focus on Shelly.
                                                             16
                                                                  December.
17
                Okav.
                                                             17
                                                                             Okay. When you go in to do a review,
18
                So your review would only cover the
                                                             18
                                                                  what documentation do you look at?
19
     union employees?
                                                             19
                                                                             We look at their trainees, who they
20
                                                             20
                                                                  have on board as their trainees and apprentices,
21
                Okay. Did your review cover promotions
                                                             21
                                                                  and at their minorities and females, and any good
22
    for union employees into management?
                                                             22
                                                                  faith efforts that they've done in trying to meet
23
                We looked at it, see if they done any
                                                             23
                                                                  their minority and female goals per
24
     promotions. But we can't tell them they have to
                                                             24
                                                                  classification.
```

```
13
                                                                                                                       15
                If you could turn to Exhibit No. 1.
                                                                              Okay. "Is there" -- okay.
     You might went to flip that stack over. Is that
                                                              2
                                                                              And it's marked "yes" next to that. Do
 3
     Exhibit 1?
                                                              3
                                                                   you see that?
                                                                   Α.
                                                                              IIh-huh
     Α.
                Yeah.
                If you want to take a minute and look
                                                                              Do you recall what evaluation process
 5
     Ο.
                                                              5
                                                                   you were told was being conducted annually?
 6
     at that.
                                                              6
7
                Okay.
                                                              7
                                                                              They said if they had an opening, then
                Do you need a few more minutes or do
                                                              8
                                                                   they had an evaluation process that they go
                                                                   through to see who would be promoted into a
     you recognize that document?
10
                I recognize this, yes.
                                                             10
                                                                  position.
                Okay. Now, this is a Shelly Company
                                                                   Ο.
                                                                              Did they tell you what the evaluation
11
     Ο.
                                                             11
     contractor compliance review dated March 9th of
12
                                                             12
                                                                   process was?
13
     '05, and your name is below that. Did you prepare
                                                             13
                                                                              No. I didn't ask because there was --
14
     this report?
                                                             14
                                                                   their paperwork didn't show that they had an
15
                                                             15
                                                                   opening for a promotion. The only time I would
16
                Okay. Was your meeting -- well, strike
                                                             16
                                                                   ask for that is if there's an opening for a
17
     that
                                                             17
                                                                   promotion.
18
                You met with Ms. Gales to prepare this
                                                                   Ο.
                                                                              Under that it's got "documentation
                                                             18
19
                                                             19
                                                                   provided" with Xs next to several different items.
     report?
                No. I -- she sent me her
                                                                  Are these all of the items that they sent you?
20
                                                             2.0
                                                                              Uh-huh. Under where it says, "list of
21
     documentation, I went over it, and then I met with
                                                             21
22
     these guys and we went over the report.
                                                             22
                                                                   employees promoted," there was a page in there
23
                No. I'm sorry. Ms. Gales sent you the
                                                             2.3
                                                                   that said none was promoted.
2.4
     documentation for you to look at?
                                                             2.4
                                                                              Okay. Turn to page 11, under A
                                                         14
                                                                                                                       16
1
                Right.
                                                              1
                                                                   Personnel Operations.
 2
                You looked at it, and then you met with
                                                              2
                                                                              Uh-huh.
                                                                              It's marked "yes" next to "Is there an
3
     who?
                Dan Montgomery, Rob Sharrett, Candace
                                                              4
                                                                   annual review of minority and female employees for
     Gales, Becky Nuthers and Terry George.
                                                              5
                                                                   promotional opportunities?" Do you know what you
 5
                So she sent you the documentation, you
                                                              6
                                                                   based that on?
 6
7
     went over it, prepared the report, and then you
                                                              7
                                                                              They said they do have one if there's
     met with everyone?
                                                                   an opening for management position for promotion.
8
                                                              8
                                                                  They don't have any -- if they didn't have a
9
                IJh-huh
                                                              9
10
                And it was your opinion that they were
                                                             10
                                                                   promotion -- an opening for a promotion, they
11
     in compliance?
                                                             11
                                                                   didn't have a review done that year.
12
                                                             12
                                                                              So, in other words, if they have an
13
                If you could turn to page 8 of the
                                                             13
                                                                   opening, then they annually review minorities and
     report, under Training, B, in the middle of the
                                                                  females?
14
                                                             14
15
     page next to the paragraph that reads: "Is there
                                                             15
                                                                  Α.
                                                                              If they have an opening for a position.
16
     an evaluation process conducted annually of at
                                                             16
                                                                              Are you aware of any minority or female
17
     least all minority and female personnel for
                                                                   employees that have been promoted into foreman
                                                             17
18
     promotional opportunities to encourage these
                                                             18
                                                                   positions?
19
     employees to seek or prepare for such
                                                             19
                                                                              No. I haven't seen an opening for one
20
     opportunities."
                                                             20
                                                                   in their office.
21
                Do you see that paragraph?
                                                             21
                                                                              But are you aware of any?
22
                At the top here?
                                                             22
                                                                   Α.
     Α.
23
                No. It's in the middle of the page on
                                                             23
                                                                              Okay. And the next category is marked
     Ο.
24
     page 8.
                                                             24
                                                                   "yes." "Is there encouragement of minority and
```

```
17
                                                                                                                     19
     female employees to seek promotional
                                                                  Miller acquisition, the Columbus Construction
     opportunities?" Did they tell you what this
                                                              2
                                                                  Group did not promote any employees during the
 3
     encouragement was?
                                                              3
                                                                  2006 construction season." But that evaluation is
                                                                  2005. I'm sorry -- the compliance review is 2005.
                I -- I don't have the review here in
                                                              4
     front of me, so I really don't know.
                                                                             Also, if you could turn to Exhibit
 5
                                                              5
                Okay. The next category is: "Are
                                                                  No. 18. And I know it's going to be kind of hard
 6
                                                              6
 7
     there efforts to assist minority and female
                                                              7
                                                                  for you, but if you can keep all the exhibits
     employees to prepare for promotion?" And that's
                                                              8
                                                                  marked in, like, one stack.
     marked "yes." Do you recall what efforts they
                                                              9
                                                                             MS. ALAG BIRD: Here, let's do this.
10
     told you they used to assist minority and female
                                                             10
                                                                  Let's flip these over as you go through these
                                                                  here, keep them in order. Do you see 18? Okay.
     employees to prepare for promotion?
11
                                                             11
12
                No, I don't. I -- like I said, I don't
                                                             12
                                                                             MR. KELLY: Can I just see whatever
13
     have the review here, the whole review in -- I
                                                             13
                                                                  document you're discussing or referring to?
14
     mean, this is just part of it. The whole
                                                             14
                                                                             MS. CUNNINGHAM: I'm sorry. Do you
15
     documentation, I don't have it in front of me so I
                                                             15
                                                                  have a copy? It's Exhibit -- this one. I'm
16
     -- I can't really --
                                                             16
                                                                  referring her back to Exhibit 18.
                I subpoenaed documentation from ODOT.
                                                             17
                                                                             MR. KELLY: Well, I want to see what it
17
18
     And if you would like to go off the record, you
                                                             18
                                                                 is you're --
     can take a look at that.
                                                             19
                                                                             MS CUNNINGHAM: This isn't Exhibit 18
19
                MS. CUNNINGHAM: Let's go off the
                                                             20
                                                                             MR. KELLY: I understand.
20
21
     record and give her an opportunity to look at it.
                                                             21
                                                                             Now, Exhibit No. 18, you've got that in
22
                (A short recess is taken.)
                                                             22
                                                                  front of you?
23
                Have you now had an opportunity to
                                                             23
     review most of that stack of documents?
                                                             2.4
                                                                             That says at the bottom, the last
                                                         18
 1
                Uh-huh. Yes.
                                                                  paragraph, that Ron Gutridge, Caucasian, filled in
                                                             1
                Can you tell what documentation you
                                                              2
                                                                  for Brad Boyer. Mr. Boyer moved out of a former
                                                                  position in July of '05. But Mr. Gutridge was not
     relied on?
                From the stuff -- from the letters that
                                                              4
                                                                  formally promoted into a foreman position until
     came from the union, it says that they're
                                                                  2006. So there was a promotion in the Thornville
 5
     responding to Shelly Company's letter on hiring.
                                                              6
                                                                  Division --
 6
     And it just -- the only thing, it just says that
                                                              7
                                                                             MR. KELLY: Well, that --
                                                                             -- in 2006?
     they are under -- pursuant to state and federal
 8
                                                             8
                                                                  Q.
                                                                             MR. KELLY: That talks about during the
 9
     laws, mandates our collective bargaining as well
                                                             9
10
     as a court order to operate in nondiscriminatory
                                                             10
                                                                  2006 season. Obviously, I'm -- I'm not going to
11
     hiring from the halls. And also this is the year
                                                             11
                                                                  interfere. You might not be talking apples to
     where they did not do any -- the letter here that
12
                                                             12
                                                                  apples. I encourage you to look at that.
13
     I'm showing here from The Shelly Company, that all
                                                             13
                                                                             That wasn't on any of the paperwork
     of their available positions were hired through
                                                                  when I done the review, this one here.
14
                                                             14
15
     the Miller -- when they overtook the -- when they
                                                             15
                                                                             Right. That was produced per court
16
     bought out the Miller Company, they put their
                                                             16
                                                                  order. So referring back to this document that
     employees in those vacant positions. So there was
                                                                  you pointed out that there were no promotions in
17
                                                             17
18
     no positions within hiring for that year.
                                                             18
                                                                  the Columbus Construction Group, are you aware
19
                MR. KELLY: Teresa, obviously, not this
                                                             19
                                                                  that the construction -- Columbus Construction
20
     moment, but can you make copies for me of whatever
                                                             20
                                                                  Group was part of --
21
     is discussed?
                                                                             MR. KELLY: Melody, I'm sorry. Please
22
                MS. CUNNINGHAM: Sure.
                                                             22
                                                                  don't put that away.
                Okay. This is a letter dated December
                                                            23
                                                                             That the Columbus Construction Group
23
     the 19th of 2006. And it says: "Due to the
24
                                                             24
                                                                  was part of Thornville?
```

```
21
                                                                                                                       23
1
                MR. KELLY: During what time period?
                                                                  diaries related to monitoring and action taken as
                MS. CUNNINGHAM: It was part of -- it
                                                              2
                                                                  a result of monitoring, listing of employees
     was spun off; and I don't recall exactly --
                                                              3
                                                                  promoted, personnel files, and interviews. Do you
3
                MR. KELLY: That's why I asked the time
                                                                  recall if you were ever given personnel files?
 4
                                                              4
     period.
5
                                                              5
                MS. CUNNINGHAM: -- what year. Well,
                                                                              Okay. Did you ask Ms. Gales why you
6
                                                              6
                                                                  Ο.
7
     you tell me the time period.
                                                              7
                                                                  were not given personnel files?
                MR. KELLY: I don't know. I think Rob
                                                                              I just asked for the list of all the
                                                              8
     testified about it.
                                                              9
                                                                  personnel and their start dates.
10
                MS. CUNNINGHAM: Yeah, and I asked him.
                                                             10
                                                                             Okav.
                But are you aware the Columbus Group
                                                                             That's all that's always been required.
11
                                                             11
    used to be a part of Thornville?
12
                                                             12
                                                                  We never ask for their personnel files. I mean, I
                                                                  can look at them, but I never ask for copies of
13
                No.
                                                             13
14
    Ο.
                Okay. You weren't notified of any of
                                                             14
                                                                  them.
15
     that?
                                                             15
                                                                              Did you ever look for personnel files
16
                                                             16
                                                                  at The Shelly Company?
17
                Okay. You evaluate The Shelly Company
                                                                              Huh-uh.
                                                             17
18
    as a whole?
                                                                  Ο.
                                                                              Why not?
                                                             18
                Right.
                                                             19
                                                                              MR. KELLY: I'm sorry. Is that a no?
19
    Α.
                You don't evaluate the different
                                                                             THE WITNESS: No. It's no.
2.0
                                                             20
    Ο.
    divisions?
21
                                                             21
                                                                  Ο.
                                                                              Why not?
22
    Α.
                                                             22
                                                                             They've always given me a list of the
23
                All right. But as far as you knew,
                                                             23
                                                                  personnel. It's not in here.
    there were no promotions in 2006, correct?
                                                             2.4
                                                                              So, again, they just provide you a
                                                         22
                                                                                                                       24
1
                Right.
                                                              1
                                                                   printout of the personnel --
                Okay. So you were not told that
 2
                                                              2
     Mr. Gutridge was formally promoted in 2006?
                                                                              -- with what, their race next to it?
                                                                              Classification, hire dates.
                No, not that I know of, not that I'm
 5
    aware of.
                                                              5
                                                                              And the race -- is the race listed?
                Okay. All right. Now, back to -- or
                                                              6
                                                                              I think so.
 6
                                                                              All right. If you could turn to page
7
     I'm sorry. Are there any other documents that you
                                                              7
                                                                   Ο.
     relied on that you discovered in that file?
                                                                  14 of this report, under D, where the X is marked
                                                              8
8
                                                                  in the "no" box.
                Huh-uh. No.
                                                              a
9
10
                Okay. I just want to make sure all of
                                                             10
                                                                              Uh-huh.
11
     these kind of stay separate from the exhibits.
                                                             11
                                                                              "Are there formal charges of
                I just flipped it upside down.
                                                             12
                                                                  discrimination pending against the contractor,
12
                                                                  including EEOC or OCRC charges?" That's marked
13
                Okay. Would it be fair to say that
                                                             13
     when you complete these contract compliance
                                                                   "no." Did you get that information from
14
                                                             14
                                                                  Ms. Gales?
15
     reviews, that you just rely on what Shelly
                                                             15
16
     employees tell you?
                                                             16
                                                                  Α.
                                                                              Yes.
                                                             17
                Yes.
                                                                              Okay. Were you aware that Mr. Gibson
17
    Α.
                                                                  had filed an EEOC charge?
18
                Okay. On page 11 of Exhibit No. 1 in
                                                             18
19
     the middle of the page where it's got
                                                             19
                                                                              No.
20
     "Documentation Provided" --
                                                             20
                                                                              Okay. Do you look at any
21
                                                             21
                                                                   documentation, or do you just rely on what
22
                -- and it's marked that -- I'm assuming
                                                             22
                                                                  Ms. Gales tells you?
23
    that you received a copy of the EEO officer's job
                                                             23
                                                                              If -- I just ask the question. I go
                                                                   through and ask the questions. And then if
24
    description, records, reports, analysis and
                                                             2.4
```

```
25
                                                                                                                       27
     there's any documentation that says, yes, there
                                                              1
                                                                              Right.
2
     is, then they have to provide it.
                                                              2
                                                                              MR. ALAG BIRD: Remember to answer yes
3
                Okay. But they didn't provide you a
                                                              3
                                                                  or no so the court reporter can take down your
     copy of Mr. Gibson's charge?
                                                              4
                                                                  answer
                No.
                                                                              THE WITNESS: Yes. I'm sorry.
5
                                                              5
                                                                              MS. CUNNINGHAM: I don't have an extra
 6
     Ο.
                Okav.
                                                              6
 7
                MR. KELLY: Are you representing for
                                                              7
                                                                   copy of this one.
     the record that a charge was pending at the time
                                                              8
                                                                              MR. KELLY: Okay. If you are going to
     the information was provided?
                                                              9
                                                                   ask her about it, I guess I would like to have a
10
                MS. CUNNINGHAM: I'm fairly certain
                                                             10
                                                                  copy of it, please.
     that it was filed in January.
                                                                              (A short recess is taken.)
11
                                                             11
                MR. KELLY: Do you know when -- I mean,
12
                                                             12
                                                                              I'm handing you what's been marked as
     I don't know when -- you know the date of her
13
                                                             13
                                                                  Plaintiff's Exhibit 20. If you would like, take a
14
     report. You don't know when Candace provided the
                                                             14
                                                                  few minutes and look at that document.
15
     information, obviously.
                                                             15
16
                MS. CUNNINGHAM: No. But --
                                                             16
                                                                            Thereupon, Plaintiff's Exhibit 20 is
17
                When does Ms. Gales provide this
                                                             17
                                                                  marked for purposes of identification.
18
     information to you?
                                                             18
                Our reviews is one year behind. So if
                                                             19
                                                                              Okay. Can you tell me what Exhibit
19
                                                                  Ο.
     it's a 2005 review, it's actually 2004 projects
                                                                  No. 20 is?
2.0
                                                             2.0
     we're looking at. So we're always a year behind.
21
                                                             21
                                                                  Α.
                                                                              It's a review on The Shelly Company
22
                But she would provide you current
                                                             22
                                                                  done on January 25th of '07.
23
     information?
                                                             23
                                                                              And that was prepared by you?
2.4
                No. Just for what we were asking for.
                                                             2.4
                                                                              Yes.
                                                         26
     I'm looking for the dates.
                                                              1
                                                                              And as we just discussed, you're a year
1
 2
                Oh, okay. Is that in the front?
                                                              2
                                                                  behind, so the information in this document would
                MR. ALAG BIRD: We're just looking at
                                                                  have covered 2006?
 3
     this document right now. Just look at this.
5
                THE WITNESS: Okay.
                                                                              Okay. Correct?
                                                              5
                                                                  Ο.
 6
                Yeah. On the one page it says, Other
                                                              6
                                                                              And I believe you testified that you
7
     sufficient observations and comments for the
                                                              7
                                                                  were told that once an opening was identified,
     review period of 1-1-04 through 12-31 of '04 is
                                                                  then this evaluation process would be conducted to
8
                                                              8
     this review.
                                                                   see that all minority and female personnel have an
9
                                                              9
10
                Okay. Are you aware that Mr. Gibson
                                                             10
                                                                   opportunity at that promotion, correct?
11
     filed an EEOC charge in 2004?
                                                             11
                                                                              Yes.
12
                                                             12
                                                                              And every year you had been told there
13
                And you weren't told that, obviously,
                                                             13
                                                                  were no openings, right?
     correct?
                                                                              Correct.
14
                                                             14
                                                                  Α.
15
     Α.
                                                             15
                                                                              And then I referred you to Exhibit
16
                This document has a review date of
                                                             16
                                                                  No. 18, which reflects that, in fact, a
     March the 9th of '05. Did you meet with Ms. Gales
17
                                                                  Mr. Gutridge was promoted in 2006, correct?
                                                             17
     on that date, or is that the date you prepared the
18
                                                             18
                                                                              That's what this says, yes.
19
     report?
                                                             19
                                                                              Were you aware of that when you
20
                No, that's the day we met.
                                                             20
                                                                  prepared this report?
21
                Oh, okay. So if you're a year behind,
                                                             21
22
     wouldn't it be fair to say that your '07 report
                                                             22
                                                                              Okay. So it would be fair to say that
23
     reflects what went on in '06?
                                                             23
                                                                  you were not provided any documentation showing
                Uh-huh.
                                                                   that promotion for the 2006 year?
24
                                                             24
```

```
31
                                                                   opening?
                Right.
                                                              1
2
                Okay. If you could turn to page 8 of
                                                              2
 3
     Exhibit 20, this is the section we had discussed
                                                              3
                                                                              That's not true?
     for the earlier year regarding the evaluation
                                                                   Α.
                                                                              No, that's true.
     process. And did you cover this section with
                                                              5
                                                                              Oh, okay. So it is true.
 5
                                                                   Ο.
     Ms. Gales when you went through this review?
                                                                              Okay. So they've never gotten to this
 6
                                                              6
 7
                Yes.
                                                              7
                                                                   issue of the evaluation process because it was
                Okay. Do you recall what she told you?
                                                                   your understanding that there was never a job
                                                              8
                No, I don't.
                                                              9
                                                                   opening?
10
                Are you aware of any females or
                                                             10
                                                                   Α.
                                                                              Right.
11
     minorities being promoted in The Shelly Company in
                                                                   Ο.
                                                                              Did you think that was odd?
                                                             11
     the years that you've done the contract compliance
                                                             12
12
                                                                              MR. ALAG BIRD: Objection. Go ahead
13
     reviews?
                                                             13
                                                                   and answer.
14
     Α.
                No.
                                                             14
                                                                   Q.
                                                                              Does that strike you as being odd?
15
                So would it be fair to say that --
                                                             15
                                                                              MR. ALAG BIRD: Objection. Go ahead
16
     well, strike that.
                                                             16
                                                                   and answer the question.
17
                Since you had said that in response to
                                                             17
                                                                              Not really.
18
     the Training B for the evaluation process, were
                                                             18
                                                                   Ο.
                                                                              Not really?
19
     you always told that there was no opening, so,
                                                             19
                                                                              I mean, being a large company, I don't
20
     therefore, there was no process conducted of
                                                             20
                                                                   -- young -- young foremens, I don't see were one
     minorities and females to see if they would be
21
                                                             21
                                                                   of them is going to leave in a hurry.
22
     available for that promotion?
                                                             22
                                                                              But this just isn't about foreman
23
                MR. KELLY: Objection.
                                                             23
                                                                   positions. So this question on page 8 of the
2.4
                MR. ALAG BIRD: Go ahead and answer the
                                                                   compliance review, is it restricted to foreman?
                                                         30
                                                                                                                       32
1
     question.
                                                              1
                                                                  Α.
 2
                I just -- I don't understand the
                                                              2
                                                                              Turn back to Exhibit No. 18, please.
     question.
3
                When we went through the previous
                                                                              Okay. Exhibit No. 18 in the second
 5
     exhibit --
                                                                  paragraph, it says, "During the 2004 season The
                                                              5
 6
                Okav.
                                                              6
                                                                   Shelly Company promoted Dave Scott, a Caucasian,
     Α.
                -- it was my understanding we went
                                                              7
                                                                  from position of distributor man." So if we go
     through your '05 evaluation, which was for the '04
                                                                  back to Exhibit No. 1, okay, which is your 2005
 8
                                                              8
     time period. It was my understanding when we got
                                                                  report, which actually covers the year 2004,
9
                                                              9
10
     to page No. 8 and this section under Training, and
                                                             10
                                                                   correct?
11
     I asked you about if there -- you had marked "yes"
                                                             11
                                                                   Α.
                                                                              Yeah.
     in response to the question: "Is there an
12
                                                             12
                                                                              Were you told that there was an opening
13
     evaluation process conducted annually of at least
                                                             13
                                                                  and that Dave Scott was filled -- filled that
14
     all minority and female personnel for promotional
                                                                  opening?
                                                             14
     opportunities?"
15
                                                             15
                                                                   Α.
                                                                              No.
16
     Δ.
                Okav.
                                                             16
                                                                  Ο.
                                                                              No.
                That you were told that only if there
                                                             17
                                                                              Okay. And when we turn to page 8,
17
     is an opening identified, that then The Shelly
                                                                  again, of Exhibit No. 1, and you had told me that
18
                                                             18
19
     Company tells you whether or not this process has
                                                             19
                                                                   they told you if they identified a position that
20
     been complied with; is that correct?
                                                             20
                                                                   then they went through this evaluation process of
21
                                                                  all minority and female individuals, correct?
22
                Is it true that all the years you have
                                                             22
                                                                              MR. ALAG BIRD: Objection. You can
23
     been conducting compliance reviews on The Shelly
                                                             23
                                                                  answer.
24
     Company that they have never identified an
                                                             24
                                                                  Α.
                                                                              Yes.
```

```
33
                                                                                                                        35
                Okay. And isn't it true that they did
                                                                               Oh, I'm sorry. Maybe I misunderstood
2
     not tell you that there were any positions open?
                                                               2
                                                                   your statement. Yes.
3
                MR. ALAG BIRD: Objection. You can
                                                               3
                                                                              Do they provide you a copy of that?
                                                                              No. I just have copies of the reports.
 4
     answer.
                                                               4
                                                                   Ο.
                                                                              You're talking about the statistical
 5
     Α.
                Yes.
                                                               5
                And based on Exhibit No. 18, that
 6
                                                               6
                                                                   reports?
7
     appears to not be a true statement, correct?
                                                               7
                                                                              Uh-huh.
                MR. KELLY: Objection.
                                                                              The long 11-by-18 --
                MR. ALAG BIRD: Objection.
9
                                                               9
                                                                              Uh-huh.
10
                MR. KELLY: I object to form. What in
                                                              10
                                                                              MR. ALAG BIRD: Answer yes or no.
     Exhibit 18? Oh, Exhibit 18. I thought you meant
11
                                                              11
                                                                              Yes.
     No. 1. Go ahead.
12
                                                              12
                                                                   Ο.
                                                                              Do those statistical reports reflect
13
                You may answer the question.
                                                              13
                                                                   promotions, or do you know?
14
                Yes.
                                                              14
                                                                               I don't know.
15
                Okay. Let me take a break.
                                                              15
                                                                               Okay. Do they produce any analysis?
16
                (A short recess is taken.)
                                                              16
                                                                              I don't know.
17
                If you can look at Exhibit No. 1, which
                                                              17
                                                                              Did they produce any diaries related to
     is your 2005 compliance review for the year 2004,
18
                                                              18
                                                                   monitoring and action as a result of monitoring?
19
     what documents did Shelly provide to you?
                                                              19
                                                                               I don't know.
                                                                   Δ.
                It's in the file. I don't have them
                                                                              And I believe they did provide a list
2.0
                                                              20
                                                                   Ο.
     here. It's -- it's about something like these.
21
                                                              21
                                                                   of employees promoted?
22
                Do you mean that entire stack or just
                                                              22
                                                                   Α.
                                                                              Uh-huh.
23
     that small stack?
                                                              2.3
                                                                   Ο.
                                                                              And that was none?
2.4
                Oh, no, there was a big stack.
                                                              2.4
                                                                               Right.
                                                          34
                                                                                                                        36
                Because when I subpoenaed the
                                                               1
                                                                   Ο.
                                                                              They told you no, none?
1
     documents, there were stacks and stacks.
                                                               2
                                                                              Right.
                                                                              And that would have been for the year
3
                Right.
                                                                   2004, correct?
                If you went through all that stuff, is
     it -- are the documents they provided you in that
                                                               5
     stack, or do you not know until you actually --
                                                                              Okay. And we've discussed personnel
 6
                                                               6
                I do not know until I would compare it
                                                               7
                                                                   files; they didn't produce those. And did they
                                                                   produce any documentation regarding interviews?
     with what I have in my files.
8
                                                               8
                Okay. And we covered they didn't
9
                                                               9
                                                                              No.
10
     produce any personnel files --
                                                              10
                                                                              Okay. Would you explain your job
11
     Α.
                                                              11
                                                                   duties as related to reporting Shelly's promotions
                                                              12
                                                                   of minorities and females?
12
                -- correct?
13
                Did they provide you any job
                                                              13
                                                                              MR. ALAG BIRD: Objection to the form
     description records? And this, again, comes out
14
                                                              14
                                                                   of the guestion.
     of page 11 of Exhibit No. 1, in the middle of the
15
                                                              15
                                                                   Α.
                                                                              I don't -- I don't understand that.
16
     page it says, "Documentation Provided."
                                                              16
                                                                              MR. ALAG BIRD: Go ahead and answer her
                For the EEO officer?
                                                                   question.
17
                                                              17
                Well, it's -- as I understand this,
18
                                                              18
                                                                   Α.
                                                                              That's not one of my job duties.
19
     this relates to the information before -- above
                                                              19
                                                                              Okay. Tell me what these compliance
20
     it -- I'm sorry -- above it for promotional
                                                              20
                                                                   reviews are designed to do.
21
     opportunities. It's under Section A, "Personnel
                                                              21
                                                                              To make sure there is good faith
22
     Operations."
                                                              22
                                                                   efforts in meeting their minority and female
23
                But it says copy of -- of EEO officer's
                                                              23
                                                                   goals.
                                                                              And those goals are simply for hiring;
     job description.
24
                                                              24
                                                                   Ο.
```

```
37
                                                                                                                     39
     they're not promotional?
                                                                            No.
 2
                Right.
                                                             2
                                                                            That information is just simply not
                Okay. So it would be fair to say, as
                                                             3
                                                                  relevant; is that right?
 3
 4
     far as you know, they haven't met goals for
                                                             4
                                                                            Correct
 5
     promotions?
                                                                            When you do your review, are you
                                                             5
                                                                  looking at Shelly company-wide, or do you just
 6
                MR. KELLY: Objection.
                                                             6
                                                                 look at certain job classifications?
7
                MR. ALAG BIRD: Objection.
                                                             7
                                                                             I look at their construction job
 8
     Α.
                I don't do goals for --
                                                                 classifications.
9
     Q.
                For promotions?
                                                             9
10
     Α.
                 -- promotions.
                                                            10
                                                                             Okay. Now, does that include the
                                                                 Asphalt Division and everything else?
11
                So your report doesn't reflect that?
     Ο.
                                                            11
                                                            12
12
     Α.
                No.
                                                                            No. It's just the construction part of
13
     Ο.
                Not at all?
                                                            13
                                                                 it.
14
     Α.
                Huh-uh
                                                            14
                                                                 Ο.
                                                                            Just construction.
15
                So when you found they were in
                                                            15
                                                                             Does that include analysis of
     compliance, it didn't have anything to do with
16
                                                            16
                                                                 foreman-type positions?
17
     promotions, right?
                                                            17
                                                                            No, sir.
18
     Α.
                Right.
                                                                             So you were referred by Ms. Cunningham
                                                            18
                                                            19
                                                                 to Exhibit 18, the document in your left hand
19
                MR. ALAG BIRD: Objection. Go ahead
                                                                 there, ma'am.
                                                            20
20
     and answer.
                                                                             In light of the limited scope of your
21
                It only had to do with statistics of
                                                            21
22
     individuals hired from the unions?
                                                            22
                                                                 analysis, is the information contained in
23
                                                            23
                                                                  Exhibit 18 necessarily inconsistent with any of
2.4
                MS. CUNNINGHAM: Let's go off the
                                                                 your reports?
                                                                                                                     40
1
     record.
                                                             1
 2
                (A short recess is taken.)
                                                             2
                                                                             And is the information contained in
                MS. CUNNINGHAM: I have no further
                                                                  Exhibit 18, in light of the limited scope of your
                                                             3
                                                                  analysis, necessarily inconsistent with any
     questions.
 5
                                                             5
                                                                  information that Shelly Company provided to you?
 6
                      CROSS-EXAMINATION
                                                             6
                                                                             I didn't understand your question.
7
     BY MR KELLY:
                                                             7
                                                                             Because it was a horrible question,
                                                                  Ο.
8
                I have a couple. Ms. Conrad, my name
                                                             8
                                                                  ma'am.
     is Brian Kelly. We met, well, just a short while
9
                                                             9
                                                                             You have a limited scope of your
                                                                  analysis, right?
10
     ago this afternoon. I represent The Shelly
                                                            10
11
     Company in connection with a number of lawsuits
                                                            11
                                                                  Α.
12
     and other actions brought by Ray Gibson. Today
                                                            12
                                                                             In light of that, the information in
     we're here in connection with one of Mr. Gibson's
                                                                  Exhibit 18, is that necessarily inconsistent with
13
                                                            13
14
     federal lawsuits. I have just a couple questions
                                                                  any information Shelly provided to you?
                                                            14
     regarding that lawsuit.
                                                            15
15
                                                                  Α.
16
                I believe you told Ms. Cunningham that
                                                            16
                                                                  Ο.
                                                                             There were questions of you and of
     evaluating The Shelly Company's promotional
17
                                                            17
                                                                  Ms. Gales today about whether you have some sort
18
     efforts is not a part of your review process; is
                                                                  of relationship outside of work.
                                                            18
19
     that correct?
                                                            19
20
                Correct.
                                                            20
                                                                             Did you ever reach any conclusions as
21
                So the information about promotions at
                                                            21
                                                                  to The Shelly Company's compliance or
22
     The Shelly Company, is that material at all to
                                                                  noncompliance because of your relationship with
23
     your findings as to whether Shelly is in
                                                            23
                                                                 Ms. Gales or anyone else at The Shelly Company?
     compliance or not?
2.4
                                                            2.4
                                                                             No.
```

```
41
                                                                                                                      43
                Did you evaluate the data to the best
                                                              1
     of your ability and reach those conclusions that
                                                              2
                                                                             MS. CUNNINGHAM: Okay. I have no
 3
     seemed justified in accordance with the
                                                              3
                                                                  further questions.
     regulations you administer?
                                                                             MR. KELLY: Thank you for your time,
                                                              4
                Yes.
 5
                                                              5
                                                                  Ms. Conrad.
                                                                             THE REPORTER: Is she reserving her
 6
                And your conclusions were that as far
                                                              6
 7
     as you could tell, The Shelly Company --
                                                              7
                                                                  right to read the transcript?
                MS. CUNNINGHAM: Objection, leading.
                                                              8
                                                                             MR. ALAG BIRD: You have the
     Would you just answer -- ask her a question
                                                              9
                                                                  opportunity to read the transcript and review it
10
     instead of giving her the answer and testifying.
                                                             10
                                                                  for any inaccuracies only in transcription, but
                I think you told Ms. Cunningham your
                                                                  you can't change your testimony in any way. Would
11
                                                             11
12
     conclusion, having done that, was that the company
                                                             12
                                                                  you like to read the transcript?
     was in compliance; is that right?
13
                                                             13
                                                                             THE WITNESS: No.
14
                Yes.
                                                             14
                                                                             MR. ALAG BIRD: We'll waive. Thanks.
15
                                                             15
                Thank you, Ms. Conrad.
16
                MS. CUNNINGHAM: Do you have any
                                                             16
                                                                           Thereupon, the foregoing proceedings
17
     questions?
                                                             17
                                                                            concluded at 2:45 p.m.
18
                MR. ALAG BIRD: I do not.
                                                             18
19
                                                             19
2.0
                  FURTHER CROSS-EXAMINATION
                                                             20
21
     BY MS. CUNNINGHAM:
                                                             21
22
                I have just a few follow-up.
                                                             22
23
                In response to Brian's question, you
    had stated that the report didn't reflect any --
                                                         42
     it was not inconsistent with what they told you.
                                                              1
                                                                  State of Ohio
                                                                                  :
                                                                                          CERTIFICATE
 1
                                                                  County of Franklin: SS
 2
     But yet when I questioned you -- and, again, refer
                                                              2
     to Exhibit No. 1, page 8. As I recall your
                                                                      I, Stacy M. Upp, a Notary Public in and for the
                                                              3
     testimony, and perhaps you're changing it now, but
                                                              4
                                                                  State of Ohio, certify that Melody Conrad was by me
 5
     when we went through --
                                                                  duly sworn to testify to the whole truth in the
 6
                MR. ALAG BIRD: Objection.
                                                              6
                                                                  cause aforesaid; testimony then given was reduced
 7
                -- under B, under Training, I asked
                                                              7
                                                                  to stenotype in the presence of said witness,
     you -- that was marked "yes." I asked you about
                                                                  afterwards transcribed by me; the foregoing is a
 8
                                                              8
 9
     whether or not there was an evaluation process
                                                              9
                                                                  true record of the testimony so given; and this
10
     conducted annually of all -- at least all minority
                                                             10
                                                                  deposition was taken at the time and place
11
     and female personnel. And, in fact, you testified
                                                             11
                                                                  specified on the title page.
     that you were told that unless there is an
                                                             12
12
                                                                      Pursuant to Rule 30(e) of the Fed. R. Civ. P.,
13
     opening, they identify an opening, they do not do
                                                             13
                                                                  the witness and/or the parties have waived review
     an evaluation process, correct?
14
                                                             14
                                                                  of the deposition transcript.
15
     Α.
                Correct.
                                                             15
                                                                      I certify I am not a relative, employee,
16
                So you were not given any
                                                             16
                                                                  attorney or counsel of any of the parties hereto,
     documentation; you weren't told there was an
17
                                                             17
                                                                  and further I am not a relative or employee of any
18
     opening, correct?
                                                             18
                                                                  attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto,
19
                Correct.
                                                             19
                                                                  or financially interested in the action.
20
                And this was an evaluation dated May
                                                             20
                                                                      IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand
21
     17th of '05; it reflects the information for '04.
                                                             21
                                                                  and affixed my seal of office at Columbus, Ohio, on
22
     And Exhibit No. 18 reflects that there was, in
                                                             22
                                                                          ___, 2008.
23
     fact, a promotion in '04, correct?
                                                             23
24
                For a foreman, ves.
                                                             24
                                                                  Stacy M. Upp, Notary Public - State of Ohio
```

	44.15.10	05.10.20.5		
A	44:16,18	25:10 39:7	connection 38:11	currently 5:20
Abel 1:7	available 18:14	certify 44:4,15	38:13	C-O-N-R-A-D 5:8
ability 41:2	29:22	change 43:11	Conrad 1:12 3:7	-
acquisition 19:1	Avenue 1:15,20	changed 8:24	3:19 5:1,8	D
action 23:1	aware 16:16,21	changing 42:4	38:8 41:15	D 4:1 24:8
	20:18 21:11	character 3:14	43:5 44:4	Dan 14:4
35:18 44:19	22:5 24:17	charge 24:18	construction 6:8	data 41:1
actions 38:12	26:10 28:19	25:4,8 26:11	6:10 7:12,14	date 25:13 26:16
administer 41:4	29:10	charges 24:11,13	19:1,3 20:18	
affixed 44:21	29:10	circumstances		26:18,18
aforesaid 44:6			20:19,19,23	dated 13:12
afternoon 3:1	В	11:17	39:8,12,14	18:23 42:20
38:10	B14:14 29:18	Civ 44:12	contained 39:22	dates 23:9 24:4
ago 6:22 7:10	42:7	classification	40:2	26:1
8:23 11:11	back 10:10 19:16	10:10 12:24	contract 7:6,9	Dave 32:6,13
38:10	20:16 22:6	24:4	9:22 22:14	day 26:20
agreement 3:10	32:2,8	classifications	29:12	December 12:16
ahead 29:24	bargaining 18:9	39:7,9	contractor 8:21	18:23
31:12,15 33:12	based 16:6 33:6	Cleveland 2:8	8:23 9:3 10:8	Defendant 1:8
36:16 37:19	Becky 14:5	collective 18:9	10:14,15 13:12	2:6
	BEHALF 2:2,6,10	Columbus 1:16,20	24:12	deposed 5:13
Alag 2:13 19:9	believe 28:6	2:12 19:1	contractor's	deposed 3.13 deposition 1:12
26:3 27:2	35:20 38:16	20:18,19,23	9:10	3:7,10,16,17
29:24 31:12,15	best 41:1	21:11 44:21	copies 18:20	5:12 44:10,14
32:22 33:3,9	big 33:24	comes 34:14	23:13 35:4	description
35:10 36:13,16		comments 26:7	copy 19:15 22:23	_
37:7,19 41:18	Bird 2:13 19:9		25:4 27:7,10	22:24 34:14,24
42:6 43:8,14	26:3 27:2	companies 8:5		designed 36:20
amount 9:15	29:24 31:12,15	company 1:7 5:11	34:23 35:3	diaries 23:1
analysis 22:24	32:22 33:3,9	8:9 10:15	correct 21:24	35:17
35:15 39:15,22	35:10 36:13,16	11:21,24 13:11	26:14 28:5,10	didn't 15:13,14
40:4,10	37:7,19 41:18	18:13,16 21:17	28:14,17 30:20	16:9,11 25:3
and/or 44:13	42:6 43:8,14	23:16 27:21	32:10,21 33:7	34:9 36:7
annual 16:4	board 12:20	29:11 30:19,24	34:12 36:4	37:16 40:6
annually 12:12	bottom 19:24	31:19 32:6	37:23 38:19,20	41:24
14:16 15:6	bought 18:16	38:11,22 40:5	39:4 42:14,15	different 15:19
16:13 30:13	Boulevard 2:4	40:23 41:7,12	42:18,19,23	21:20
42:10	box 24:9	Company's 18:6	counsel 3:6,17	discovered 22:8
answer 27:2,4	Boyer 20:2,2	38:17 40:21	44:16,18	discrimination
29:24 31:13,16	Brad 20:2	company-wide	counties 9:8,11	24:12
32:23 33:4,13	break 33:15	39:6	County 44:2	discussed 18:21
35:10 36:16	Brian 2:8 38:9	compare 34:7	couple 38:8,14	28:1 29:3 36:6
37:20 41:9,10	Brian's 41:23	complete 22:14	court 1:1 18:10	discussing 19:13
appears 33:7	brought 38:12	compliance 7:6,9	20:15 27:3	distributor 32:7
apples 20:11,12	business 12:4,4	8:5,8 9:23	cover 10:12,18	district 1:1,1
apprentices		11:15 12:6	10:21 29:5	8:6,7,21,22,24
12:20	С	13:12 14:11	covered 28:3	9:8,14,15,16
asked 21:4,10	C2:1 44:1,1	19:4 22:14	34:9	districts 9:21
23:8 30:11	called 3:8	29:12 30:23	covers 32:9	Division 1:2
42:7,8	Candace 11:7	31:24 33:18	Cross 4:3,3,4	20:6 39:11
	14:4 25:14	36:19 37:16	cross-examina	divisions 21:21
asking 5:15	can't 5:16 10:24	38:24 40:21	3:8 5:4 38:6	document 13:9
25:24	17:16 43:11	41:13	41:20	19:13 20:16
Asphalt 39:11		complied 30:20	Cunningham 2:3	26:4,16 27:14
assign 8:4	captioned 5:10 case 1:6 5:10	concluded 43:17	4:3,4 5:5,9	28:2 39:19
assigned 8:6,7		conclusion 41:12	17:20 18:22	documentation
9:5	category 16:23	conclusions	19:14,19 21:2	11:5 12:18
assist 17:7,10	17:6	40:20 41:2,6	21:6,10 25:10	13:21,24 14:6
Assistant 2:11	Caucasian 20:1	conducted 14:16	25:16 27:6	
assume 5:18	32:6	15:6 28:8	37:24 38:3,16	15:18 17:15,17
assuming 22:22	cause 44:6	29:20 30:13	39:18 41:8,11	18:2 22:20
attached 4:22	Cavalier 2:4	42:10		24:21 25:1
attendance 3:6	central 11:19		41:16,21 43:2	28:23 34:16
attorney 2:11	certain 8:5	conducting 30:23	current 25:22	36:8 42:17

```
documents 17:24
                     30:8,13 31:7
                                      flip 13:2 19:10
                                                           20:10 27:8
                                                                             isn't 19:19
 22:7 33:19
                     32:20 42:9,14
                                      flipped 22:12
                                                           31:21
                                                                               31:22 33:1
 34:2,5
                     42:20
                                      Floor 2:12
                                                          good 10:1,4,5,7
                                                                             issue 31:7
doesn't 37:11
                   eventually 6:4
                                      Florence 2:4
                                                           12:21 36:21
                                                                             items 15:19,20
doing 7:6,9,22
                     7:2
                                      focus 10:16
                                                          gotten 31:6
                                                                             it's6:22 9:13
 7:24 8:2,11,16
                   exactly 21:3
                                      follows 5:3
                                                          Group 19:2 20:18
                                                                               10:6 14:23
 11:14
                   Examination 4:2
                                      follow-up 41:22
                                                           20:20,23 21:11
                                                                               15:2,18 16:3
dollar 9:15
                   exhibit 13:1,3
                                      force 3:18
                                                          quess 9:4 27:9
                                                                               19:6,15 22:19
don't 5:17 16:9
                     19:5,15,16,19
                                      foregoing 43:16
                                                          Gutridge 20:1,3
                                                                               22:22 23:20,23
 17:4,5,12,12
                     19:21 22:18
                                        44:8
                                                           22:3 28:17
                                                                               25:20,20 27:21
 17:15 20:22
                     27:13,16,19
                                      foreman 16:17
                                                          guys 13:22
                                                                               33:20,21,21
                     28:15 29:3
                                        20:4 31:22,24
 21:3,8,20
                                                                               34:18,21 39:12
                     30:5 32:2,4,8
 25:13,14 27:6
                                        42:24
                                                                  Н
                                                                             I'11 5:15,18
 29:9 30:2
                     32:18 33:6,11
                                      foreman-type
                                                                             I'm 5:23 6:9
                                                          halls 18:11
                     33:11,17 34:15
                                        39:16
 31:19,20 33:20
                                                                               7:11 8:18 9:4
                                                          hand 39:19 44:20
 35:14,16,19
                     39:19,23 40:3
                                      foremens 31:20
                                                                               13:23 18:13
                                                          handing 27:12
                                      form 33:10 36:13
 36:15,15 37:8
                     40:13 42:3,22
                                                                               19:4,14,15
                                                          hard 19:6
                                                                               20:10,10,21
                   exhibits 4:5,22
                                      formal 24:11
Due 18:24
                                                          haven't 16:19
duly 5:2 44:5
                     19:7 22:11
                                      formally 20:4
                                                                               22:4,7,22
                                                           37:4
                                        22:3
                                                                               23:19 25:10
duties 6:11 7:20
                   explain 36:10
                                                          hear 5:16
                                      former 20:2
 36:11,18
                   expressly 3:16
                                                          hereto 44:16,18
                                                                               26:1 27:5,12
                                      found 37:15
                                                                               34:20 35:1
                   extra 27:6
                                                          hereunto 44:20
        Е
                                      Franklin 44:2
                                                                             I've 7:24 8:15
                                                          hire 24:4
                           F
                                      Frantz 2:7
                                                          hired 5:24 18:14
E 2:1,1,12 4:1
                                                                                     J
                                      friends 12:2,4
 44:1,1
                   F 44:1
                                                           37:22
                                      front 17:5,15
                   fact 28:16 42:11
earlier 29:4
                                                          hiring 18:6,11
                                                                             J2:8
                                        19:22 26:2
East 1:15
                                                           18:18 36:24
                     42:23
                                                                             January 25:11
                                      further 4:4 38:3
EASTERN 1:2
                   fair 22:13 26:22
                                                          horrible 40:7
                                                                               27:22
                                        41:20 43:3
EEO 7:6,20 11:19
                     28:22 29:15
                                                          Huh-uh 22:9
                                                                             job 6:11 7:20
 22:23 34:17,23
                     37:3
                                        44:17
                                                           23:17 37:14
                                                                               22:23 31:8
EEOC 24:13,18
                                                                               34:13,24 36:10
                   fairly 25:10
                                                          hurry 31:21
                                               G
                   faith 10:1,4,5,7
 26:11
                                                                               36:18 39:7,8
                                      Gales 11:7,10
effect 3:18
                     12:22 36:21
                                                                  I
                                                                             Judge 1:7,7
                   far 21:23 37:4
efforts 10:1,4,5
                                        13:18,23 14:5
                                                                             July 20:3
                                                          identification
 10:7 12:22
                     41:6
                                                                             justified 41:3
                                        23:6 24:15,22
                                                           27:17
 17:7,9 36:22
                   Fed 44:12
                                        25:17 26:17
                                                          identified 28:7
 38:18
                   federal 18:8
                                        29:6 40:17,23
                                                                                     K
                                                           30:18,24 32:19
                     38:14
employed 5:20
                                      Gay 2:12
                                                          identify 42:13
                                                                             keep 19:7,11
                   female 10:2,9
 44:18
                                      General 2:11
                                                          inaccuracies
                                                                             Kelly 2:8 4:3
employee 44:15
                     12:23 14:17
                                      George 14:5
                                                            43:10
                                                                               18:19 19:12,17
 44:17
                     16:4,16 17:1,7
                                      getting 12:8
                                                          include 39:10,15
                                                                               19:20 20:7,9
employees 10:13
                                      Gibson 1:4 2:16
                     17:10 28:9
                                                          including 24:13
                                                                               20:21 21:1,4,8
 10:19,22 14:19
                     30:14 32:21
                                        5:10,10 24:17
                                                                               23:19 25:7,12
                                                          inconsistent
 15:22 16:4,17
                     36:22 42:11
                                        26:10 38:12
                                                           39:23 40:4,13
                                                                               27:8 29:23
 17:1,8,11
                   females 12:21
                                      Gibson's 25:4
                                                           42:1
                                                                               33:8,10 37:6
                                        38:13
 18:17 19:2
                     16:14 29:10,21
                                                          individuals
                                                                               38:7,9 43:4
                     36:12
                                      give 17:21
 22:16 23:2
                                                           32:21 37:22
                                                                             kind 19:6 22:11
 35:21
                   file 22:8 33:20
                                      given 23:4,7,22
                                                          information
                                                                             knew 21:23
Employment 2:11
                   filed 24:18
                                        42:16 44:6,9
                                                           24:14 25:9,15
                                                                             know 11:7 16:5
encourage 14:18
                     25:11 26:11
                                      giving 41:10
                                                           25:18,23 28:2
                                                                               17:5 19:6 21:8
 20:12
                   files 23:3,4,7
                                      go 9:24 12:12,17
                                                           34:19 38:21
                                                                               22:4 25:12,13
encouragement
                     23:12,15 34:8
                                        15:8 17:18,20
                                                                               25:13,14 34:6
                                                           39:2,22 40:2,5
 16:24 17:3
                     34:10 36:7
                                        19:10 24:23
                                                           40:12,14 42:21
                                                                               34:7 35:13,14
entire 33:22
                   filled 20:1
                                        29:24 31:12,15
                                                                               35:16,19 37:4
                                                          inspection 6:13
Esq 2:3,8,13
                     32:13,13
                                        32:7 33:12
                                                          inspector 6:3,16
                                                                             KY 2:4
evaluate 21:17
                   financially
                                        36:16 37:19,24
                                                          inspectors 6:12
 21:20 41:1
                     44:19
                                      goal 10:5
                                                          interested 44:19
                                                                                     L
evaluating 38:17
                   findings 38:23
                                      goals 10:2,4,5
                                                          interfere 20:11
                                                                             L3:4
evaluation 14:16
                   first 5:2,24
                                        12:23 36:23,24
                                                          interviews 23:3
                                                                             large 31:19
 15:5,8,11 19:3
                     11:9
                                        37:4,8
                                                           36:8
                                                                             Law 2:11
 28:8 29:4,18
                   five 8:16,23
                                      going 8:14 19:6
                                                          involved 9:19
                                                                             laws 18:9
```

May 14, 2008 Melody Conrad

Page 47

lawsuit 38:15
lawsuits 38:11
38:14
leading 41:8
leave 31:21
left 39:19
letter 4:6 18:6
18:12,23
letters 10:8
18:4
let's 10:16
17:20 19:9,10 37:24
light 39:21 40:3
40:12
limited 39:21
40:3,9
list 15:21 23:8
23:22 35:20
listed 24:5
listing 23:2
live 9:2
LLC 1:15,19
long 8:11 35:8
look 10:6 12:18
12:19 13:5,24
17:19,21 20:12 23:13,15 24:20
26:4 27:14
33:17 39:7,8
looked 10:23
14:2
looking 25:21
26:1,3 39:6
lot 9:18

M **M** 44:3,24 Magistrate 1:7 main 9:10 man 32:7 management 10:22 11:1 16:8 mandates 18:9 Marbley 1:7 March 13:12 26:17 marked 15:2 16:3 16:23 17:9 19:8 22:22 24:8,13 27:12 27:17 30:11 42:8 material 38:22 ma'am 39:20 40:8 mean 6:14 10:3 17:14 23:12 25:12 31:19 33:22 meant 33:11

```
11:12 12:22
 26:17
meeting 10:1,3
 13:16 36:22
Melody 1:12 3:7
 3:19 5:1,8
 20:21 44:4
met 11:18.20
 13:18,21 14:2
 14:8 26:20
 37:4 38:9
middle 14:14,23
 22:19 34:15
Miller 18:15,16
 19:1
minorities 10:9
 12:21 16:13
 29:11,21 36:12
minority 10:2
 12:23 14:17
 16:4,16,24
 17:7,10 28:9
 30:14 32:21
 36:22 42:10
minute 13:5
minutes 13:8
 27:14
misunderstanding
 7:11
misunderstood
 35:1
moment 18:20
monitoring 23:1
  23:2 35:18,18
Montgomery 4:6
 14:4
moved 6:5,7,18
 6:23 7:2 20:2
        N
```

N2:1 3:4 4:1 **name** 5:6,7,9 13:13 38:8 necessarily 12:14 39:23 40:4,13 **need** 12:8 13:8 never 23:12,13 30:24 31:6,8 noncompliance 40:22 nondiscrimina... 18:10 **notary** 3:9,11,14 44:3,24 notes 3:11 notice 3:9 notified 21:14 number 38:11 Nuthers 14:5

0 o 3:4 **object** 33:10 Objection 29:23 31:12,15 32:22 33:3,8,9 36:13 37:6,7,19 41:8 42:6 observations 26:7 obviously 18:19 20:10 25:15 26:13 OCRC 24:13 odd 31:11,14 **ODOT** 5:21,22,24 8:4,23 9:19 11:13,22,23,23 17:17 office 9:10 11:19,20 16:20 44:21 **officer** 34:17 officer's 22:23 34:23 official 3:13 **Oh** 1:16 2:8,12 7:19 9:17 11:23,23 26:2 26:21 31:5 33:11,24 35:1 Ohio 1:1,20 2:11 44:1,4,21,24 **okay** 5:15 6:18 6:23 7:5,11,16 7:21 8:2,7,13 9:4,4,9,12,22 10:16,17,21 11:2,7,9,12,14 12:5,9,17 13:7 13:11,16 15:1 15:1,24 16:23 17:6 18:23 19:11 21:14,17 22:2,6,10,13 22:18 23:6,10 24:17,20 25:3 25:6 26:2,5,10 26:21 27:8,19 28:5,22 29:2,8 30:6,16 31:5,6 32:3,4,8,17 33:1,15 34:9 35:15 36:6,10 36:19 37:3 39:10 43:2 once 12:10 28:7 open 33:2 opening 15:7,15

15:16 16:8,10

16:13,15,19

```
28:7 29:19
  30:18 31:1,9
  32:12,14 42:13
  42:13,18
openings 28:13
operate 18:10
Operations 16:1
  34:22
opinion 14:10
0
0
O
0
O
0
Ο.
P
\mathbf{p}
```

opinion 14:10							
opportunities							
14:18,20 16:5							
17:2 30:15							
34:21							
opportunity							
17:21,23 28:10							
43:9							
order 18:10							
19:11 20:16							
original 4:22							
outside 12:4,5							
40:18							
overnight 9:19							
oversaw 6:12,14							
7:15							
overtook 18:15							
P							
P2:1,1 3:4							
44:12							
page 4:2,5 14:13							
14:15,23,24							
15:22,24 22:18							
22:19 24:7							
26:6 29:2							
30:10 31:23							
32:17 34:15,16							
42:3 44:11							
paperwork 15:14							
20:13							
paragraph 14:15							
14:21 20:1							
32:5							
part 17:14 20:20							
20:24 21:2,12							
38:18 39:12							
parties 44:13,16							
44:18							
pending 24:12							
25:8							
period 21:1,5,7							
26:8 30:9							
person 8:13							
personnel 14:17							
16:1 23:3,4,7							
23:9,12,15,23							
24:1 28:9							
30:14 34:10,21							
36:6 42:11							
place 44:10							
Plaintiff 1:5							
2:2 3:8							
_ 1 <u>_</u> 3 1 3							

```
Plaintiff's 4:5
  27:13,16
please 5:7,17
  20:21 27:10
 32:2
point 7:5
pointed 20:17
Pooja 2:13
position 5:22
  6:2,5,7,19,23
  7:3,13 11:1
 15:10 16:8,15
 20:3,4 32:7,19
positions 16:18
  18:14,17,18
  31:23 33:2
 39:16
prepare 13:13,18
 14:19 17:8,11
prepared 14:7
  26:18 27:23
  28:20
presence 3:12
  44:7
PRESENT 2:15
previous 30:4
printout 24:1
problem 12:7
proceedings
  43:16
process 14:16
 15:5,8,12 28:8
  29:5,18,20
  30:13,19 31:7
  32:20 38:18
 42:9,14
produce 34:10
  35:15,17 36:7
produced 20:15
project 6:3,8,10
  6:16 7:12,14
projects 6:12,15
  7:15 25:20
promote 11:1
 19:2
promoted 6:4
 7:17 15:9,22
 15:23 16:17
 20:4 22:3 23:3
 28:17 29:11
 32:6 35:21
promotion 15:15
 15:17 16:8,10
 16:10 17:8,11
 20:5 28:10,24
 29:22 42:23
promotional
 14:18 16:5
 17:1 30:14
  34:20 37:1
```

meet 10:4 11:9

```
38:17
                                        17:13,24 19:4
                                                          set 44:20
                     34:14
                                                                             stenotypy 3:11
promotions 10:21
                   reduced 3:10
                                        20:14 25:20
                                                          seven 9:8,11
                                                                             Stewart 1:15,20
 10:24 20:17
                     44:6
                                        26:8,9,16
                                                          Sharrett 14:4
                                                                             stipulated 3:6
 21:24 35:13
                   refer 42:2
                                        27:21 29:6
                                                          Shelly 1:7 5:11
                                                                             stopped 9:20
 36:11 37:5,9
                   referred 28:15
                                        31:24 33:18
                                                            8:8 9:6 10:14
                                                                             Street 2:12
 37:10,17 38:21
                     39:18
                                        38:18 39:5
                                                           10:16 11:21,24
                                                                             strike 13:16
proof 3:13
                   referring 19:13
                                        43:9 44:13
                                                           13:11 18:6,13
                                                                               29:16 31:14
provide 23:24
                     19:16 20:16
                                      reviews 7:6,10
                                                            21:17 22:15
                                                                             stuff 18:4 34:4
 25:2,3,17,22
                   reflect 35:12
                                        8:5,8,16 9:11
                                                            23:16 27:21
                                                                             subpoenaed 17:17
 33:19 34:13
                     37:11 41:24
                                        9:20 10:12
                                                            29:11 30:18,23
                                                                               34:1
                                        11:15 12:6,9
 35:3,20
                   reflects 26:23
                                                           32:6 33:19
                                                                             sufficient 26:7
provided 15:19
                     28:16 42:21,22
                                        12:13 22:15
                                                                             Suite 2:4
                                                           38:10,17,22,23
 22:20 25:9,14
                                        25:19 29:13
                                                           39:6 40:5,14
                                                                             sure 6:17 9:24
                   regarding 29:4
                                        30:23 36:20
 28:23 34:5,16
                                                                               18:22 22:10
                     36:8 38:15
                                                            40:21,23 41:7
                                      right 14:1 20:15
                                                          Shelly's 36:11
                   regulations 41:4
                                                                               36:21
 40:5,14
                                                                             sworn 5:2 44:5
Public 2:7 44:3
                   related 23:1
                                        21:19,23 22:1
                                                          short 17:22
                     35:17 36:11
                                        22:6 24:7 26:4
                                                            27:11 33:16
 44:24
purposes 27:17
                   relates 34:19
                                        27:1 28:13
                                                            38:2,9
                                                                                      т
                                        29:1 31:10
pursuant 18:8
                   relationship
                                                          show 15:14
                                                                             T 3:4,4 44:1,1
                                        34:3 35:24
 44:12
                     40:18,22
                                                          showing 10:1
                                                                             take 13:5 17:19
put 18:16 20:22
                                        36:2 37:2,17
                                                           18:13 28:23
                   relative 44:15
                                                                               27:3,13 33:15
p.m1:16 3:2
                     44:17
                                        37:18 39:3
                                                          signature 3:15
                                                                             taken 1:15 3:9
                   relevant 39:3
 43:17
                                        40:10 41:13
                                                          signed 3:18
                                                                               17:22 23:1
                   relied 18:3 22:8
                                        43:7
                                                          simply 36:24
                                                                               27:11 33:16
        Q
                   rely 22:15 24:21
                                      Rob 14:4 21:8
                                                           39:2
                                                                               38:2 44:10
                                      Ron 20:1
                   Remember 27:2
                                                          sir 39:17
qualification
                                                                             talk 12:3,5
                   repeat 5:17
                                      Rule 44:12
                                                          small 33:23
 3:14
                                                                             talking 20:11
                   replies 10:10
                                                          sorry 6:9 8:18
question 5:16,19
                                                                               35:5
                                               S
 24:23 30:1,3
                   report 11:2
                                                           13:23 19:4,14
                                                                             talks 20:9
                                                            20:21 22:7
 30:12 31:16,23
                     13:14,19,22
                                      s 2:1 3:4,4
                                                                             tech 5:23 7:1,18
                     14:7,14 24:8
                                                            23:19 27:5
                                      says 5:2 15:21
 33:13 36:14,17
                                                                             techs 8:4
                     25:14 26:19,22
                                                            34:20 35:1
                                        18:5,7,24
 40:6,7 41:9,23
                                                                             tell 9:22 10:24
                     28:20 32:9
                                                          sort 40:17
                                                                               11:3 15:11
questioned 42:2
                                        19:24 25:1
                     37:11 41:24
                                                          SOUTHERN 1:1
questions 5:16
                                        26:6 28:18
                                                                               17:2 18:2 21:7
 24:24 38:4,14
                   reporter 27:3
                                        32:5 34:16,23
                                                          specialist 6:8
                                                                               22:16 27:19
 40:16 41:17
                     43:6
                                       schedule 12:11
                                                            6:10 7:12,15
                                                                               33:2 36:19
                   reporting 1:15
                                                          specified 44:11
 43:3
                                      scope 39:21 40:3
                                                                               41:7
                     1:19 36:11
                                                          Spectrum 1:15,19
                                        40:9
                                                                             tells 24:22
                   reports 12:8
        R
                                                          spell 5:7
                                      Scott 32:6,13
                                                                               30:19
                     22:24 35:4,6
                                                          spun 21:3
                                      seal 44:21
                                                                             Teresa 2:3 5:9
R2:1 44:1,12
                     35:12 39:24
                                                          Square 2:7
                                                                               18:19
                                      season 19:3
race 24:3,5,5
                   represent 5:10
                                        20:10 32:5
                                                          ss 44:2
                                                                             Terry 14:5
Ray 5:10 38:12
                     38:10
                                                          stack 13:2 17:24
                                       second 32:4
                                                                             testified 21:9
Raymond 1:4 2:16
                   representing
                                                            19:8 33:22,23
reach 40:20 41:2
                                      section 2:11
                                                                               28:6 42:11
                     25:7
                                                            33:24 34:6
                                        29:3,5 30:10
                                                                             testifies 5:2
read 43:7,9,12
                   requesting 10:9
                                                          stacks 34:2,2
                                        34:21
                                                                             testify 44:5
reads 14:15
                   required 23:11
                                                          Stacy 44:3,24
                                       see 7:19,21 10:6
                                                                             testifying 41:10
really 17:5,16
                   requirement 10:6
                                                          start 23:9
                                        10:23 14:21
                                                                             testimony 42:4
 31:17,18
                   reserving 43:6
                                                          started 7:9
                                        15:3,9 19:11
                                                                               43:11 44:6,9
recall 11:17
                   resides 9:3
                                                          state 2:11 5:6
 15:5 17:9 21:3
                                        19:12,17 28:9
                                                                             Thank 41:15 43:4
                   responding 18:6
                                                           18:8 44:1,4,24
                                        29:21 31:20
                                                                             Thanks 43:14
 23:4 29:8 42:3
                   response 29:17
                                                          stated 41:24
received 22:23
                                       seek 14:19 17:1
                                                                             that's 7:12 8:16
                     30:12 41:23
                                                          statement 33:7
recess 17:22
                                      seen 16:19
                                                                               17:8 21:4
                   restricted 31:24
                                                            35:2
 27:11 33:16
                                       sending 10:8
                                                                               23:11,11 24:13
                   result 23:2
                                                          STATES 1:1
                                      sent 13:20,23
                                                                               26:20 28:18
 38:2
                     35:18
                                                          statistical 35:5
                                        14:6 15:20
                                                                               31:3,4 36:18
recognize 13:9
                   review 8:22 9:16
                                                            35:12
                                       separate 22:11
                                                                             there's 9:1
 13:10
                     9:23 10:18,21
                                                          statistics 37:21
                                      September 12:15
                                                                               15:16 16:7
record 5:7 17:18
                     11:5 12:17
                                                          stay 22:11
                                        12:15
                                                                               25:1
 17:21 25:8
                     13:12 16:4,11
 38:1 44:9
                                      series 5:15
                                                          stays 9:19
                                                                             they're 9:7,7
                     16:13 17:4,13
                                                          stenotype 44:7
                                      Session 3:1
                                                                               10:3 18:5 37:1
records 22:24
```

				Page 45
they've 12:22	5:18 19:20	Xs 15:19		
_		AB 13.13	2	
23:22 31:6	30:2 34:18		2:45 43:17	
thing 18:7	36:15 40:6	Y	20 4:6 11:11	
think 21:8 24:6	understanding	Yeah 13:4 21:10	27:13,16,20	
31:11 41:11	9:5 30:7,9	26:6 32:11	29:3	
Thornville 20:5	31:8	year 7:8 12:10		
20:24 21:12	union 10:7,9,12	12:12 16:11	2004 25:20 26:11	
thought 33:11	10:14,15,19,22		32:5,9 33:18	
_		18:11,18 21:6	36:4	
time 3:9 12:12	18:5	25:19,21 26:21	2005 19:4,4	
12:15 15:15	unions 10:11	28:1,12,24	25:20 32:8	
21:1,4,7 25:8	37:22	29:4 32:9	33:18	
30:9 43:4	UNITED $1:1$	33:18 36:3	2006 18:24 19:3	
44:10	Upp 44:3,24	years 6:22 7:10		
title 44:11	upside 22:12	7:22 8:1,12,14	20:5,8,10	
today 5:12 38:12	apprac 22 · 12		21:24 22:3	
_		8:16,23 11:11	28:3,17,24	
40:17	V	29:12 30:22	2008 1:16 3:2	
told 15:6 17:10	vacant 18:17	Yoakum 4:6	44:22	
22:2 26:13	vs 1:6 5:11	young 31:20,20	22nd 2:12	
28:7,12 29:8		you're 8:2,6,7	25th 27:22	
29:19 30:17		10:7 19:13,18		
32:12,18,19		26:21 28:1	27 4:6	
36:1 38:16	waive 43:14			
	waived 3:15,16	35:5 42:4	3	
41:11 42:1,12	44:13	you've 8:13	3-27-07 4:7	
42:17	want 13:5 19:17	19:21 29:12	30(e) 44:12	
top 14:22	22:10			
trainees 12:19	Ward 2:7	0	3331:15,20	
12:20	wasn't 20:13	04 26:8 30:8	38 4:3	
Training 14:14				
29:18 30:10	way 43:11	42:21,23	4	
42:7	Wednesday 3:1	05 13:13 20:3	41 4:4	
	went 8:18 11:24	26:17 30:8	41042 2:4	
transcribed 3:12	13:2,21,22	42:21	43206 1:16,20	
44:8	14:7 26:23	06 26:23	43215 2:12	
transcript 3:16	29:6 30:4,7	07 26:22 27:22		
4:22 43:7,9,12	32:20 34:4	07-377 1:6	44114 2:8	
44:14	42:5	0, 3,, 1.0		
transcription	-	1	5	
43:10	weren't 21:14	1	5 4:3	
	26:13 42:17	1 5:23 6:3,8,10		
transportation	We'll 43:14	7:1,18 13:1,3	6	
5:23 7:1,18	we're 5:12 12:3	22:18 32:8,18		
8:4	25:21,21 26:3	33:12,17 34:15	614-444-1000	
traveling 9:1,18	38:13	42:3	1:21	
true 30:22 31:3	we've 36:6			
31:4,5 33:1,7	what's 5:22	1-1-04 26:8	7	
44:9		1:50 1:16 3:2	71 2 : 4	
truth 44:5	27:12	100 2:4	'=	
	WHEREOF 44:20	11 15:24 22:18	8	
trying 12:22	witness 2:10 3:7	34:15		
turn 13:1 14:13	3:13,15,17	11-by-18 35:8	814:13,24 29:2	
15:24 19:5	23:20 26:5	12-31 26:8	30:10 31:23	
24:7 29:2 32:2	27:5 43:13	127 2:7	32:17 42:3	
32:17	44:7,13,20	14 1:16 3:2 24:8	800-635-9071	
	words 16:12		1:21	
		15 6:22 7:10,24	1.77	
	work 6:17 40:18	8:12,14	9	
U3:4	worked 8:21,22	150 2:12	-	
Uh-huh 7:7 11:4	9:15	17th 42:21	9th 13:12 26:17	
11:16 12:1	wouldn't 26:22	18 19:6,11,16,19		
14:9 15:4,21	writing 3:11	19:21 28:16		
16:2 18:1	www.spectrumr	32:2,4 33:6,11		
22:21 24:10	1:22			
26:24 35:7,9	<u> </u>	33:11 39:19,23		
35:22		40:3,13 42:22		
understand 5:17	X	19th 18:24		
under stand 5.1/	x 4:1 24:8	1988 6:1		